

Beacon Hill Architectural Commission
Public Hearing Minutes
Boston City Hall, Piemonte Room
Boston, MA, 02201

September 20, 2018

Commissioners Present: Paul Donnelly, Joel Pierce, Miguel Rosales, Kenneth Taylor, Danielle Santos

Commissioners Not Present: Thomas Hopkins, P. T. Vineburgh

Staff Present: Joe Cornish, Gabriela Amore

5:00 PM K. Taylor called the public hearing to order.

Violations

60 Chestnut Street (19.176 BH): Installation of deck railing at rooftop deck at rear garage; installation of HVAC condensers at garage roof; proposal to install temporary mesh screening in front of condensers.

Representative: John Holland, Holland Companies.

The applicant presented images of the noted violations, and informed the Commission that he was present once before, for the approval of the roof deck at this property. The applicant also suggested that the Commission conduct a site visit to see the property, and proposed adding more brick layers to the wall to hide the view of the condensers.

The Commission stated that they never approved any condensers on the property. They also noted that the applicant's presentation lacked a coherent proposed solution for the violation. They suggested moving the condensers to where they would not be visible from Branch Street.

Public testimony was called for and Christy Nicholas, an abutter at 58 Chestnut Street, expressed her initial concern for the repercussions of violators, questioned the process for notifying abutters, and objected to the current height of the deck. The Lee family of 62 Chestnut Street submitted documentation they compiled regarding the history of the property and when the violation arose. They voiced concern over ambiguity of the initial wording of the proposed work, and felt that the construction was deceptive. James Lee also expressed concern over the loss of light to his garden at 62 Chestnut Street, and his opinion that the railing and HVAC units not be visible from Branch Street.

The Commission discussed continuing this application and requested that staff work with the applicant and the abutters to identify the existing violations and return with a proposed solution.

In conclusion the application was continued. P.T. Vineburgh initiated the motion and K. Taylor seconded the motion. The vote in favor of a continuance was 5-0 (PD, MR, JP, KT, PTV).

Design Review

120 Charles Street (18.1447 BH): Repair window sashes and storm windows.

Representative: Zack Sambucci

The applicant presented photos of existing conditions and described the proposed scope of work. He stated there are no plans to replace the windows- work includes restoration of the glazing and replacement of the glass of the storm windows if cracked.

The Commission discussed the scope of the window repair. After determining what areas of the window were going to be repaired, the Commission suggested that all the windows be painted the same color to match those at the first floor.

There was no public comment.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with the following proviso. M. Rosales initiated the motion and J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0 (PD, MR, JP, KT, PTV).**
 - **The applicant is to paint the windows all the same color as they are painted on the first floor.**

32-34 Hancock Street (18.1511 BH): Replace asphalt shingles at roof in kind in "Black Pepper"; replace awning fabric at dormer in "Driftwood Tweed".

Representative: Kelly Robbins, Charlesgate Property Management

The applicant presented photos of existing conditions and plans to replace asphalt shingles and awning fabric. The applicant clarified that the awning equipment was approved by the Commission on 3/16/2017, and that they are willing to make the awning covering whatever color the Commission feels appropriate.

The Commission discussed the history of the property which sustained damage from a recent fire.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner P.T. Vineburgh recused himself from the vote

- **In conclusion the application was approved. M. Rosales initiated the motion and J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (PD, MR, JP, KT).**

34 Beacon Street (18.713 BH): Install new intercom and camera system in wooden lintel to replace existing at front door in brass finish.

Representative: Mona Bonnot

The applicant presented photos of existing conditions, and explained that their proposed new intercom is very similar to the existing one, and it fits into the existing trim as well. They proposed a second option, but they prefer the first one presented

The Commission felt that the first intercom proposed is the best solution. There was no public comment.

- **In conclusion the application was approved as submitted. P. Vineburgh initiated the motion and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0 (PD, MR, JP, KT, PTV).**

55-57 Brimmer Street (19.118 BH): Demolish and reconstruct rear one-story addition on back of carriage house; replace HVAC units on roof.

Representative: Don Mills, Mills Whitaker Architects, LLC.

The applicant presented photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work. He explained that he has received zoning approval for this project, and that the work will be used as an extension of the Park Street School. He also explained that the deck is intended for passive use and is primarily an egress.

The Commission discussed options for moving the location of the railing and keeping it as simple as possible. They also suggested not trying to match the side faux door with the front door, and also suggested that installing fenestration instead of a faux door might be a better idea. The Commission clarified the reasoning behind adding a deck in the proposed addition, determining that there was not a specified use for it. They expressed concern over placing a major piece of HVAC equipment in the yard, as it could inhibit the use of the garden area for students and suggested placing the condensers on the roof.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with the following proviso. K. Taylor initiated the motion and P.T. Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 3-2 (PTV, PD, KT). (MR, JP opposed the vote)**
 - **Return to the Commission with a new design for the faux garage door on Brimmer Street that reflects its current function of a window.**

20 Temple Street (19.092 BH): Install copper connector downspout diagonally across building.

Representatives: Hilary Gouthro, RRR Waterproofing, Inc.

WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT.

4 Otis Place (19.427 BH): Replace all 17 windows on main structure to match existing materials, color and lite configuration.

Representative: Monika Pauli, Pauli & Uribe Architects, LLC.

The applicant presented photos of existing conditions and plans for proposed work. Ms. Pauli explained that initially the plan was to replace the two-over-two windows with six-over-six sash,

but the current plan is to install all two-over-two windows. She clarified that she is not proposing to install any screens at this time.

The Commission agreed that two-over-two sash is most appropriate for this building.

- **In conclusion the application was approved as outlined with the following provisos. P. Donnelly initiated the motion and P. T. Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0 (PD, JP, KT, MR, PTV).**
 - **No screens are installed.**
 - **All windows are two-over-two sash windows.**

3 West Cedar Street (19.100 BH): Replace front door to match existing in detailing, material and dimensions; replace and repair sections of millwork and trim at entry to match existing.
Representative: Megan Morgan, Payne/Bouchier

The applicant presented photos of existing conditions, plans for proposed work, and explained that the proposed work is necessary due to damage caused by fire. The applicant explained that existing plywood in the doorway is temporary and necessary for security. The applicant further explained her plans for using the same species of wood, and re-using the existing hardware.

The Commission questioned the use of plywood as a security measure, and clarified the materials being used for the door and the hardware. The Commission suggested a historic door company evaluate the door that was fire damaged, to determine whether or not it was historic. The applicant should consider restoring the door if it is determined to be historic.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with the following proviso. P.T. Vineburgh initiated the motion and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0 (PD, JP, KT, MR, PTV)**
 - **Confirmation from a preservation expert that the door is not historic.**

83 Chestnut Street (19.424 BH): Install fire connections on front elevation; replace pendant light in entry vestibule; install address numbers to left of entrance in mortar joints; construct roof deck.
Representative: Damon Bay

The applicant presented photos of existing conditions and plans for proposed work. The applicant explained that the roof deck railing was determined by staff to be not visible from a public way and exempt. Staff confirmed this information. The applicant explained that the height of the proposed strobe was determined by others found in the neighborhood.

The Commission suggested that the proposed strobe be lowered, and questioned whether the alarms need to be red. The Commission expressed concern over the size and height of the address numbers, and the finish of the proposed pendant light structure. The Commission agreed that the polished nickel finish is not a suitable option for the pendant light, and that

black or brass should be used instead. They also felt that the address numbers should be a more traditional font.

- **In conclusion there was a motion to approve the application with the following provisos. M. Rosales initiated the motion and J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0 (PD, JP, KT, MR, PTV).**
 - **The lantern be 8" x17' in a black finish.**
 - **Lower the strobe as close to the ground as possible.**
 - **Address numbers be attached to the gate in a brass finish.**

42 Chestnut Street (19.409 BH): Enlarge existing opening at rear brick wall on Branch Street and install garage door; alter curb cut at Branch Street.

Representatives: Chris Tracy and Monika Pauli.

Ms. Pauli presented photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work. She noted that there are a variety of old and new brick used in the construction of the wall. She clarified that there are no plans to cover the parking area with a roof, and that the existing trees within the garden area will remain unaffected by this project. Ms. Pauli explained that BPW and BTD have approved the proposed curb cut, and that the hardware for the proposed door will be painted black and non-protruding.

The Commission expressed concern over the lack of certain details such as information about the treatment of the door jambs, and requested more detailed explanation about how the applicants plans to address the brick on the sidewalk. The Commission also expressed concern about not having images of the inside of the wall, and not having details for the proposed steel lintel.

Staff stated that 39 letters were received in support of the project.

Public comments were heard. Joy Steel, Diana Coleman, Leslie Adams, Katie Gilmore, Linda Rockett, and Christy Nicholas all spoke in support of the project. Michelle Lourdes, a member of the Beacon Hill Civic Association's architectural committee relayed the committee's recommendation to deny the application without prejudice.

There was a motion by M. Rosales to deny without prejudice, which was seconded by J. Pierce. The motion was defeated 2-2-1 (Yea: JP, MR; Nay: KT, PTV; Abs: PD).

- **In conclusion the application was continued with the following provisos. K. Taylor initiated the motion and P.T. Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 3-2 (PD, KT, PTV) (MR and JP voted in opposition).**
 - **The applicant return with architecture details of the proposed door, wall structure, jambs, lintels and sidewalk; interior photos showing existing conditions of the interior of the garden wall; and an elevation plan of the brick walls along both sides of Branch Street as they extend from Charles Street to Spruce Street.**

37-41 Bowdoin Street (19.207 BH): Install two antenna enclosures at rooftop.

P.T. Vineburgh left the hearing.

Applicant did not appear.

ADVISORY REVIEW

15 South Russell Street: Construct vertical addition on existing three-story wood frame rowhouse; install rooftop deck.

Brigid Williams presented photos of existing conditions and plans for proposed work. The Commission requested more information about the history of the building and staff referred Ms. Williams to the Massachusetts Historical Commission for a survey form that includes information about the building's history. The Commission expressed concern about the visibility of the proposed addition and suggested that Ms. Williams and the property owner explore lowering the existing roof structure and creating an addition not visible from a public way.

ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW

- 19.412 BH 43 Anderson Street, Unit #4: Replace seven non-original 1/1 wood windows on side elevation in kind with 1/1 wood windows to match existing.
- 19.401 BH 44 Beacon Street: Scrape and paint front door and trim to match existing.
- 19.402 BH 45 Beacon Street: Repair front brownstone steps; remove lead paint at entrance, repair rotten wood at columns and trim and repaint in kind; scrape repair and repaint front window sills; repair brownstone lintels and sills at front and side elevation; repair iron platforms and balusters at front fence, repaint iron in kind; repair and repaint iron balconies; scrape and paint flagpoles at front elevation.
- 19.171 BH 30 Brimmer Street: Removal of two sets of double doors at South facing entrance to be restored off-site; install temporary doors at entrance while repairs are undertaken on original doors.
- 19.214 BH 69 Charles Street: Re-cover existing awning frame with new red Sunbrella fabric to match existing in color, no vinyl lettering.
- 19.404 BH 115 Charles Street: Replace copper gutters in kind; replace and repaint rotten fascia boards at dormer in kind.
- 19.121 BH 1-3 Chestnut Street: Replace severely deteriorated brownstone sills and lintels with concrete molded and painted to match brownstone coloring; repair damaged brownstone sills and lintels with Comproco Matrix mix; re-glaze, scrape and paint windows; repair and repaint shutters.
- 19.430 BH 17 Chestnut Street: Repaint front door to match existing color.
- 19.425 BH 41 Chestnut Street: Repoint masonry on front elevation; repaint shutters, sashes and window trim to match existing; replace three lintels

- 19.423 BH 58 Chestnut Street: Repaint entryway trim, dormers and rear bay white to match existing; repaint all windows and doors black to match existing; replace skirt board in kind.
- 19.406 BH 38 Irving Street: Remove outer wythe of brick due to pulling away from structure and reconstruct using same brick with mortar to match existing with wall ties for support. **(Approved as Emergency Repair on August 31, 2018).**
- 19.414 BH 45 Mount Vernon Street: Replace copper gutter and downspout in kind; replace purple slate roof in kind.
- 19.415 BH 47 Mount Vernon Street: Replace copper gutter and downspout in kind; replace purple slate roof in kind.
- 19.421 BH 78 Mount Vernon Street: Replace rotten wood arched molding, pilasters, panels, casing and plinth bases at entry in kind.
- 19.411 BH 71 Myrtle Street: Replace six non-original 1/1 wood windows at front and recessed side elevation with 1/1 double-hung wood windows to match existing.
- 19.427 BH 4 Otis Place: Repoint mortar on building to match existing in color and tooling; repair existing deck railing and repaint; replace pieces of missing or damaged slate roofing at mansard to match existing in color and dimensions; replace copper gutters to match existing; repair and repaint fire balconies. **(See Design Review item above).**
- 19.413 BH 64 Pinckney Street: Replace copper gutter and downspout in kind; replace black slate roof in kind; install copper flashing.
- 19.110 BH 123 Pinckney Street: Replace eight sets of window sashes at top floor and dormers in kind with 6/6 wood true divided lite windows.
- 19.420 BH 33 River Street: Repoint mortar on building to match existing in color and tooling; restore rotten wood trim at windows; remove and repair existing storm windows; clean rusted aluminum flat roof panels at oriel roof; repair sections of rotten wood trim at oriel and paint to match existing.

In conclusion the applications above were approved with provisos. M. Rosales initiated the motion and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0 (KT, PD, MR, JP, DS). Application 19.525 BH 71 Chestnut Street: At front façade re-point masonry; replace all sills and lintels with cast stone; remove existing iron grate over door and iron gate at door alcove; clean rust off existing steel beam and re-paint; replace existing wood panels in transom over double doors with new glass panes; repair all doors; replace deteriorated sections of wood trim in-kind; Replace first-story sixteen-light wood window in-kind; and re-paint all exterior wood elements and application 19.444 BH 78 Mount Vernon Street: At front façade replace rotten wood arched molding (including underside of arch), pilasters, panels, casing and plinth bases at entry in-kind were continued to 11/15/2018 as Design Review items.

Ratification of the August 26, 2018 and September 20 Public Hearing Minutes

- K. Taylor motioned to approve the minutes, and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0 (KT, PD, MR, JP, DS)

8:20 PM K. Taylor adjourned the public hearing.

