St. Botolph Area Architectural Conservation District Commission Public Hearing Minutes

Boston City Hall, Room 709 Boston, MA, 02201

May 16, 2018

Commissioners Present: Richard Henderson, Susan Trowbridge, Barbara Wennerholm

Commissioners Not Present: Francoise Elise **Staff Present:** Eric Hill, Preservation Planner

<u>5:02 PM</u> S. Trowbridge called the public hearing to order.

DESIGN REVIEW

<u>258 West Newton Street (18.1212 SB)</u>: Remove chimney on rear elevation; construct roof deck; restoration of side chimney detailing; restoration of oriel at side elevation.

The application was withdrawn prior to the hearing and was thus not reviewed.

131 St. Botolph Street (18.1399 SB): Lower sills on three windows on 2nd, 3rd and 4th floors at rear elevation and install multi-lite door; construct three partial-length cantilevered black steel balconies on 2nd, 3rd, and 4th floor at rear elevation.

Representatives: Stefano Efstratoudakis; David Freed; John Pugliani.

The applicants discussed the project and past approvals as well as showed existing site photos, sight studies, the proposed mockup, proposed elevations and precedence in the neighborhood for rear cantilevered decks. The Commission discussed what the guidelines state in terms of rear balconies and that only fire balconies required by egress are allowed; however they felt that the proposal was of high quality in design and materials.

The Commission asked about breaking the guidelines and that if one case sets prescendence. Staff expressed that each application is looked at on its own merit and various variables are taken into account including: history of the property, visibility, materials, style and age of structures. It was discussed that the new proposed doors with lowered sills would appear to look like 2/2 windows as seen on the remainder of the rear elevation and the bottom section would be obscured by the proposed black metal railings.

The Commission called for public comment and a Paul Orusho of 254 West Newton noted that any opportunity for people to be outside observing and watching over the district is a positive and that more eyes on the rear alley the better. He was supportive of the proposal.

The Commission noted in the approval that due to the lack of visibility, high quality design and materials, support of neighborhood residents and the St. Botolph Architectural Commission, they would be supportive of the project.

In conclusion the application was approved as submitted. R. Henderson initiated the motion and F. Elise seconded the motion. The vote was 3-0.

<u>173 St. Botolph Street (18.1391 SB):</u> Replace all wood windows on front elevation with 6/6 aluminum SDL windows with half screens; lower sills on garden level windows dig window wells; install new garden fence into existing granite curb; install front step hand rails. Representatives: Katherine Cipriani, GTI Properties.

The applicant showed the existing condition photographs, proposed drawings and brought a survey of materials and structures seen in the block. During the presentation, staff asked if the existing 8/8 windows at the 2nd and 3rd floor above the entrance would be replaced with 6/6 or 8/8 the applicant mentioned they would go with either option. Staff recommended that the 8/8 are replaced in kind as the same size panes are used on these windows to show continuity. The applicant also noted that any window security bars on basement level units would be removed if the basement windows would be approved. The aluminum clad windows were also discussed and it was noted that many properties in the district had aluminum clad windows and that the proposed are high quality and the profiles would be similar to the existing wood windows. Staff asked if the proposed work to lower sills on the basement windows and install new windows was required for egress by ISD and it was noted by the applicant that to their knowledge it wasn't, however, they wanted the block to be consistent and that 181 St. Botolph was recently approved for egress. The garden fence at 173 St. Botolph was noted to not be original to the site and was apparently salvaged from somewhere in the Back Bay.

The installation of the garden fence and railings were discussed and staff mentioned that it is preferred to install only into the curbing and not to attach into the structure as the curb can be replaced and repaired much easier. The applicant was agreeable to this.

In conclusion the application was approved with the following provisos to be submitted to staff. R. Henderson initiated the motion and F. Elise seconded the motion. The vote was 3-0.

- 8/8 windows are installed over the entrance on the 2nd and 3rd stories;
- The garden fence and hand rails are installed only into the curbing; and
- That the garden level window replacement and lowering of sills are only allowed if these
 windows would only be the 2nd means of egress in the structure or at 177 or 185 St.
 Botolph Street.

<u>177 St. Botolph Street (18.1392 SB):</u> Replace all wood windows on front elevation with 6/6 aluminum SDL windows with half screens; lower sills on garden level windows dig window wells; install new garden fence into existing granite curb; install front step hand rails. Representatives: Katherine Cipriani, GTI Properties.

The Commission had the same comments as 173 St. Botolph Street as the scope of work was the same.

In conclusion the application was approved with the following provisos to be submitted to staff.

- R. Henderson initiated the motion and F. Elise seconded the motion. The vote was 3-0.
 - 8/8 windows are installed over the entrance on the 2nd and 3rd stories;
 - The garden fence and hand rails are installed only into the curbing; and

That the garden level window replacement and lowering of sills are only allowed if these
windows would only be the 2nd means of egress in the structure or at 173 or 185 St.
Botolph Street.

181 St. Botolph Street (18.1393 SB): Replace all wood windows on front elevation with 6/6 aluminum SDL windows with half screens; install new garden fence into existing granite curb; install front step hand rails.

Representatives: Katherine Cipriani, GTI Properties.

The Commission had the same comments as 173 St. Botolph Street as the scope of work was the same besides the garden level window lowering of the sills and creating the window well as it was already approved and completed.

In conclusion the application was approved with the following provisos to be submitted to staff. F. Elise initiated the motion and R. Henderson seconded the motion. The vote was 3-0.

- 8/8 windows are installed over the entrance on the 2nd and 3rd stories;
- The garden fence and hand rails are installed only into the curbing.

185 St. Botolph Street (18.1394 SB): Replace all wood windows on front elevation with 6/6 aluminum SDL windows with half screens; lower sills on garden level windows dig window wells; install new garden fence into existing granite curb; install front step hand rails. Representatives: Katherine Cipriani, GTI Properties.

The Commission had the same comments as 173 St. Botolph Street as the scope of work was the same.

In conclusion the application was approved with the following provisos to be submitted to staff. R. Henderson initiated the motion and F. Elise seconded the motion. The vote was 3-0.

- 8/8 windows are installed over the entrance on the 2nd and 3rd stories;
- The garden fence and hand rails are installed only into the curbing; and
- That the garden level window replacement and lowering of sills are only allowed if these
 windows would only be the 2nd means of egress in the structure or at 171 or 173 St.
 Botolph Street.

ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW

18.1337 SB 24 Cumberland Street: Restore five cracked brownstone lintels and front door surround and recoat brownstone to match; cut and point brick steps and landing to match existing.

18.1414 SB 122 St. Botolph Street: Request extension on window replacement application

16.1613 SB; replace two garden level multi-lite vinyl windows with two pane casement windows.

18.1391 SB 173 St. Botolph Street: Clean masonry; repoint brick facades to match existing; repair fire escapes and repaint black. (See Design Review items above).

18.1392 SB 177 St. Botolph Street: Clean masonry; repoint brick facades to match existing; repair fire escapes and repaint black. (See Design Review items above).

18.1393 SB 181 St. Botolph Street: Clean masonry; repoint brick facades to match existing; repair fire escapes and repaint black. (See Design Review items above).

18.1394 SB 185 St. Botolph Street: Clean masonry; repoint brick facades to match existing; repair fire escapes and repaint black. (See Design Review items above).

In conclusion the applications were approved as submitted. R. Henderson initiated the motion and F. Elise seconded the motion. The vote was 3-0.

Ratification of the MAY 16, 2018 Public Hearing Minutes

 Approved as submitted. R. Henderson initiated the motion and F. Elise seconded the motion. The vote was 3-0.

<u>6:25 PM</u> S. Trowbridge adjourned the public hearing.