



Chilton Club facade showing Katsura on right, and Kousa Dogwood on left.



Rutgers Hybrid Kousa Dogwood planted along Commonwealth Ave. southwest of Dartmouth Street

From: Carol Bliss at Chilton Club

Date: 11/18/2019

Job: Chilton Club

Message: Here are the side walls, that had to be pushed back into place due to the movement from the root. Image 3 shows the gap created when the pillar and sidewalls were pushed back "into place".



Image 1

From: Carol Bliss at Chilton Club

Date: 11/18/2019

Job: Chilton Club

Message: Here are the side walls, that had to be pushed back into place due to the movement from the root. Image 3 shows the gap created when the pillar and sidewalls were pushed back "into place".



Image 2

From: Carol Bliss at Chilton Club

Date: 11/18/2019

Job: Chilton Club

Message: Here are the side walls, that had to be pushed back into place due to the movement from the root. Image 3 shows the gap created when the pillar and sidewalls were pushed back "into place".



Image 3

From: Carol Bliss at Chilton Club

Date: 11/18/2019

Job: Chilton Club

Message: Here are the side walls, that had to be pushed back into place due to the movement from the root. Image 3 shows the gap created when the pillar and sidewalls were pushed back "into place".



Image 4

From: Carol Bliss at Chilton Club

Date: 11/18/2019

Job: Chilton Club

Message: Here are the side walls, that had to be pushed back into place due to the movement from the root. Image 3 shows the gap created when the pillar and sidewalls were pushed back "into place".



Image 5

From: Carol Bliss at Chilton Club

Date: 11/18/2019

Job: Chilton Club

Message: Here are the side walls, that had to be pushed back into place due to the movement from the root. Image 3 shows the gap created when the pillar and sidewalls were pushed back "into place".



Image 6

From: Carol Bliss at Chilton Club

Date: 11/18/2019

Job: Chilton Club

Message: Here are the side walls, that had to be pushed back into place due to the movement from the root. Image 3 shows the gap created when the pillar and sidewalls were pushed back "into place".



Image 7

**Presentation to the Landmarks Commission
Wednesday April 11, 2018**

Hello

I am speaking tonight for the Chilton Club, 150 & 152 Commonwealth Avenue

I am Marjorie Greville, a resident of Beacon Hill

I am here in my capacity as a **Governor of Chilton Club on the Buildings & Maintenance Committee**

My Tree Credentials:

12 years on the Brookline Tree Planting Committee

presently on the Beacon Hill Civic Assoc. Street Tree Com.

Board - Emerald Necklace Conservancy - Chair of Liff Com. - overseeing implementation of the Olmsted Tree Management Plan - working on over 7,000 specific identified trees in the Emerald Necklace.

I am very dedicated to protecting, maintaining and growing Boston's tree canopy.

The Chilton Application:

The Chilton Club plans to renovate the two front gardens of 150 & 152 Commonwealth Avenue. We want to **unify the facade of the two buildings** by using the same plant material across both gardens.

The left hand garden (150 Commonwealth) has a Kousa Dogwood that we want to copy in the right hand garden. To do this we need to remove an existing Katsura Tree (*Cercidiphyllum japonicum*).

There are two good reasons to do this:

1. The Katsura is a **large specimen shade tree** that belongs in parks or at the minimum lawns with considerable root run. Our Katsura is in a restricted space which, I am told, will eventually - or may already have - lead to structural damage to the building. Our Katsura has also undergone some **unfortunate pruning** - and will have to endure more pruning as it continues to grow - to keep it off the building facade and for safety reasons.
2. Commonwealth Avenue has large shade trees down the mall, and usually smaller understory trees in the gardens along both sides. We want to be part of this design by replacing our Katsura with a Kousa Dogwood.

Origin of our Katsura - I'm not sure when it was planted - but at minimum 20 years ago - and probably more. And it probably looked nice before it outgrew the space.

In your handout - the last page is a picture of a **Katsura in the Public Garden** - one grown in sufficient space - for you to look and compare. Another interesting thing about this picture is the

root structure of the Public Garden tree is exposed - and shows you the size and density of what is also happening in our front garden - which makes it threaten the building and hard for shrubs and ground covers to grow.

It is a classic case of the wrong tree in the wrong place.

Our proposed replacement tree - Kousa Dogwood - not only matches the tree in our other front garden - but also matches the trees planted along the north side of Commonwealth to the west of Dartmouth Street.

I have been told by the Neighborhood Association that I cannot take down this tree until I have documented structural damage. I would like to say that I consider this an amazing way to care for an historic building. Is there any other situation where instead of proactively repairing an observed future problem, you are told to wait until the 'house is on fire' to correct it. I have had two arborists confirm to me that the root structure of a Katsura will lead eventually to structural damage.

I would like to have your support for replacing this tree now.

Thank you for your time tonight.

Background:

Chilton Club founded in 1920.

Buildings:

152 Commonwealth - built in 1870, designed by Henry Richards of Ware & Van Brunt. significantly remodeled in 1911 by F.L.W. Richardson of Richardson, Barott & Richardson

150 Commonwealth - built in 1879, designed by Peabody & Stearns. Acquired by Chilton Club in 1926 and combined with #152 by William Bigelow of Bigelow & Wadsworth.

3 gardens: 260 SF (with Katsura), 52 SF -center, 200SF (with dogwood)

LANDSCAPING

FRONT YARDS Historical front yard configurations shall not be altered. Where previous renovation has altered tile traditional alignment, restoration is encouraged. Extensive excavation of front yards is inappropriate.

LANDSCAPING Landscaping plans should be reviewed by the commission. Appropriate ground covers for front yards include grass, vines, or low growing plants. Clipped formal hedges and ornamental iron fences are appropriate edge treatments. The planting of flowering trees in front yards is encouraged. Trees should be dwarf varieties limited in size to 15-20 feet at maturity.



140 Washington Street
Holliston, Massachusetts 01746
T 508.429.8733 F 508.429.7991
treespecialists.com

February 27, 2018

Marjorie Greville
c/o The Chilton Club
152 Commonwealth Avenue
Boston, MA 02116

RE: Katsura tree

Dear Marjorie,

As your request, I have assessed the Katsura tree growing in front of #152 Commonwealth Avenue. There are no signs of insect and/or disease infestation, and the tree appears to be in good health. Obviously, the proximity of the tree to the building is not ideal – given that the species has the potential to grow to 60 feet in height with a spread of 30 feet or more. Eventually the space restriction will become a more acute problem, for the building, the tree, or both. From a resource management perspective, removal and replacement with a new tree of a more suitable size and location away from the building would seem reasonable.

As a degreed urban forester with 30 years of experience caring for trees in urban and exurban landscapes, I respect the contribution that all trees make to the urban environment. Still, I see no issue with tree removal and replacement as a necessary part of any long-term approach to managing developed landscapes. I do not know what laws or regulations may apply to private trees in your neighborhood, but would urge you to follow the proper protocol before taking any action with this tree.

If you have any questions regarding my opinion of the tree, feel free to communicate.

Regards,

David T. Ropes
Certified Arborist
ISA #NE-0215, MCA #1534