



BEACON HILL ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

Public Hearing Minutes

Boston City Hall, Piemonte Room

Boston, MA, 02201

August 20, 2020

Commissioners Present: Arian Allen, Matthew Blumenthal, Alice Richmond, Miguel Rosales, P.T. Vineburgh, Wen Wen

Staff Present: Nicholas Armata, Senior Preservation Planner, Gabriella Amore, Preservation Assistant, Joseph Cornish Director of Design Review

5:05 PM Commissioner Vineburgh called the public hearing to order.

1. EXECUTIVE SESSION

During the executive session, the City law department discussed the application # 19.1278 BH 37-41 Bowdoin Street for a cell phone antenna on the roof of the property. The application was originally denied by the Commission in 2019 due to the visibility of the structure and the way it altered the profile of the structure. Attorneys Nicholas O'Neil and Sean Chen explained that the decision from 2019 had been appealed in court for a potential violation of a federal communication act. While working with staff and the law department the applicant came up with a new design that reduced the profile of the equipment and modelled it after the Myrtle Street cell antennas that was recently reviewed and approved by the Commission.

2. VIOLATIONS

APP # 21.0099 BH 4 Otis Place

Applicant: Monika Pauli; Pauli and Urbie Architects.

Proposed Work: Ratification of unapproved front stair changes, penthouse window fenestrations, penthouse height & slope and penthouse cladding.

The applicant presented the details of the situation that led up to the violation and stop work order. These items include the dimensions of the penthouse, the window fenestrations and the materials of the penthouse cladding. The changes came from a ZBA hearing where the applicant was approved to move forward with the reconstruction of the



penthouse but did not seek approval from the Commission to make the changes in the violation.

The Commission discussed the violations and how to move forward. The changes made to the new proposal significantly altered several of the components of the structure. Regarding the stairs; the Commission discussed the new materials, and decided that the granite was fine, but the edges have to be smoothed. The Commission also discussed the cladding of the penthouse and determined that while the copper that was installed was not there originally, the change was fine and could remain. The Commission decided that the windows at the rear of the structure should be returned to the two that were originally there, rather than the four that were installed. It was unclear as to whether the penthouse dimensions are the same, and the Commission tasked staff to determine whether the dimensions should be changed. Additionally, the commission discussed the changes to the fire/party wall related to the height of the new penthouse. The Commission also discussed additional changes that were also violations, but not part of this application.

During the public comment period, the civic association expressed concern over the changes and that the character of the structure has been compromised and must be reversed.

In conclusion, the application to rectify the changes on the property was approved with provisos. The penthouse cladding was approved, the four windows at the rear of the structure had to be reduced back to the original two, the granite steps could stay but had to be shaved in front to smooth the rock face edge, the dimensions of the penthouse are to be remanded to staff to determine appropriateness.

Commissioner Rosales motioned to approve the application, Commissioner Richmond seconded the motion. The vote was 6-0-0 (AA, MB, AR, MR, PT, WW)

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP #: 21.0099 BH

MOTION by: ROSALES; SECOND by: Richmond

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Blumenthal*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh*, Wen

NEGATIVE: None

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>*



3. DESIGN REVIEW

APP # 21.0100 BH 7 Mount Vernon Place

APPROVED W. PROVISOS 6-0-0 (AA, MB, AR1, MR, PT2, WW)

Applicant: Monika Pauli; Pauli and Urbie Architects.

Proposed Work: repaint front door BM Black 2132-10; repaint surround black based on new historic evidence. Install keypad at front and rear entryways.

The applicant is returning to the Commission after discovering new historic documentation of the original color of the doors and surround. Additionally, new styles of keypads were presented after the original were denied at a previous hearing.

The Commission discussed the new evidence to show that the paint color is appropriate for the door and surround and saw no issue. Regarding the intercom at the front, the commission discussed whether it was visible from a public way, and determined that it was not. The keypad at the rear of the property could be mounted through the mortar joints was also approvable as long as it was not illuminated.

During public comment, the civic association saw no issue with the door color seeing that there was no evidence to support the new color.

In conclusion that application was approved with the provisos that the color sample be submitted to staff for final approval. All other items are approved as submitted.

Commissioner Richmond motioned to approve the application, Commissioner Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 6-0-0 (AA, MB, AR, MR, PT, WW).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP #: 21.0100 BH

MOTION by: Richmond; SECOND by: Vineburgh

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Blumenthal*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh*, Wen

NEGATIVE: None

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>*



APP # 21.0101 BH 116 Charles Street

Applicant: Therese Driscoll

Proposed Work: At front façade, install piping to several windows.

The applicant proposed to install several small spaghetti water lines to her water boxes that would allow them to install fresh flowers. The line will be tucked into the corners and trim around the front façade.

The Commission discussed the proposal and had some concerns over whether the project is necessary. There was concern over the visibility from the street. The Commission thought that the piping was too visible and that a plant waterer service could have the same result, without the hardware. Staff also indicated that if the owner was still interested in pursuing the project that he would work with them to have it approved.

During public comment the civic association indicated that the piping was inappropriate and should be denied.

In conclusion the application was denied w/o prejudice.

Commissioner Rosales motioned to approve the application, Commissioner Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 5-1-0 (AA, MB, MR, PT, and WW) (AR).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP #: 21.0101 BH

MOTION by: Rosales; SECOND by: Vineburgh

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Blumenthal*, Rosales*, Vineburgh*, Wen

NEGATIVE: Richmond

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>*



APP # 19.1278 BH 37-41 Bowdoin Street (Remanded to Commission for reconsideration Per Order of US District Court for District of Massachusetts)

APPROVED AS SUBMITTED 6-0-0 (AA, MB, AR₁, MR, PT₂, WW)

Applicant: Cellco

Proposed Work: Ratification of cell phone antennas visible from Bowdoin Street.

During the presentation the representative for Cellco explained that they had returned to the Commission for approval of a modified design. The new design fit closer to the existing head house than the previous proposal and was painted to match.

The Commission reviewed the project and asked if a screening was researched to further reduce the visibility of the structure and equipment. It was decided that the shield was too visible and would actually increase the structure. The Commission decided that the project was best as proposed.

There was no objection from the public.

In conclusion the application was approved as submitted.

Commissioner Richmond motioned to approve the application, Commissioner Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 6-0-0 (AA, MB, AR, MR, PT, and WW)

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP #: 19.1278 BH

MOTION by: Rosales; SECOND by: Vineburgh

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Blumenthal*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh*, Wen

NEGATIVE: Richmond

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>*



APP # 21.0102 BH 107 Myrtle Street

APPROVED AS SUBMITTED 5-0-0 (AA₁, MB, AR₂, MR, PT, WW)

Applicant: William and Holly Swan

Proposed Work: Replace head house bead board siding with black vertical panel siding.

The applicant provided the details of the application to the Commission. The head house at the property had cladding that was failing and needed to be replaced. The proposal was to replace the cladding in a black vertical panel siding.

The Commission discussed the visibility of the head house; staff indicated that there was some visibility, but it was minimal. The Commission asked what type of paneling was being proposed, the applicant answered that it was made from a fiberboard.

During public comment the civic association indicated that the materials should be a metal or wood to fit the guidelines of the district.

In conclusion the application was approved as submitted.

Commissioner Allen motioned to approve the application, Commissioner Richmond seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0-0 (AA, MB, AR, MR, PT)

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP #: 21.0102 BH

MOTION by: Allen; SECOND by: Richmond

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Blumenthal*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh*, Wen

NEGATIVE: None

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>*



**APP # 21.0104 BH 30 Hancock Street
DENIED W/O PREDJUDICE 5-0-0 (AA, MB, AR₁, MR, PT₂, WW)**

Applicant: Chientiang Zang

Proposed Work: Installation of 3 HVAC condensers at the rear of the structure.

The applicant was presenting a proposal to install multiple A/C condensers at the rear of the property that would allow for air conditioning to be installed in several units. The location is at the rear of the property but is significantly visible from the street Ridgeway Lane, which is a public street according to City records.

The Commission discussed the project and indicated that the existing A/C units were never approved and in violation of the guidelines of the district. The locations that were proposed were inappropriate and too visible from the street. The Commission encouraged the applicant to explore options on the main structure roof or a location that would not be visible from Ridgeway Lane.

During public comment the Civic Association did not support the project as is.

In conclusion the application was denied w/o prejudice and requested that the applicant work with staff to locate an appropriate location.

Commissioner Richmond motioned to approve the application, Commissioner Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0-0 (AA, MB, AR, MR, PT).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP #: 21.0104 BH

MOTION by: Allen; SECOND by: Richmond

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Blumenthal*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh*

NEGATIVE: None

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/ beacon-hill-architectural-district>*



**APP # 21.0105 BH 87 Mount Vernon Street
APPROVED AS SUBMITTED 4-0-0 (AA₂, AR, MR, PT)**

Applicant: Doug Manley; Spencer Sullivan & Vogt

Proposed Work: In kind replacement of two existing door/windows on carriage house.

The applicant presented the details of the project which involved replacing several windows on the carriage house of the property. The windows were to be a like for like replacement and were already replaced in the 1990s with sub-par materials.

The Commissioner discussed the appropriateness of the project; the design and appropriateness of the windows were discussed as well as the low-e glass which should not be approved in the district.

During public comment the civic association expressed support for the project and indicated that the project team was one of the best in the profession.

In conclusion the application was approved with the provisos that the glass will not be low-e glass.

Commissioner Vineburgh motioned to approve the application, Commissioner Allen seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0-0 (AA, AR, MR, PT).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP #: 21.0105 BH

MOTION by: Allen; SECOND by: Richmond

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh*

NEGATIVE: None

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beam-hill-architectural-district>*

4. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW/APPROVAL:

APP # 21.0103 BH 25 Charles Street: Repair slate roof, repaint ornamental metal, window trim, and metal flashing in kind, masonry repointing, replace stone sills and lintels in kind . new, true divided light windows in floors 2 through 5. (double hung and replacement) double hung windows will be 6 over 6 wood, repairs to window sills and lintels in kind, repairs to existing shutters, replacement of missing elements, replace skylight, replace three fire escape doors, new mechanical equipment and shield at rooftop.



APP # 21.0106 BH 23 Brimmer Street: At third level, front, replace 2 2 over 2 wood windows with three, 2 over 2 wood windows.

APP # 21.0107 BH 60 Chestnut Street: Scrape, repaint front door and surround in kind.

APP # 21.0109 BH 41 Phillips Street: Replace wood trim surrounding 16 dormers in kind. Install new copper pan flashing in kind. Repaint to its original color.

APP # 21.0110 BH 2 River Street Place: At level 1 restore two 2 over 1 wood windows and one 6 over 3, wood window, at level two, restore two, 6 over 6, wood windows, at level three restore two, six over six wood windows, two 6 over 6 wood windows.

APP # 21.0111 BH 119 Tremont Street: Repair Mayflower pulpit by replace deteriorated metal plates and supports in kind.

APP # 21.0112 BH 100 Pinckney Street: At front façade, repaint the front stoop and painting/repairing a wooden deck wall. Colors are in kind: BM Fairview Taupe for the stoop & BM Audubon Russet for the deck wall.

APP # 21.0113 BH 30 Mount Vernon Street: At roof level, install 60 feet of snow guards

APP # 21.0114 BH 112 Mount Vernon Street: At front and rear façade, restore seven wood historic 6 over 1 window. Replace second floor bath and master 1 over 1 windows with 6 over 6 windows.

APP # 21.0115 BH 25 West Cedar Street: repaint levels 1, 2, and 3 windows and shutters in kind. Repaint front door and trim in kind, alley door, boot scraper, Balcony, basement grate, garden rail, and front handrail in kind.

Commissioner Rosales motioned to approve the application, Commissioner Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0-0 (AA, AR, MR, PT).

RECORD OF VOTE ON ADMIN REVIEW

MOTION by: Richmond; SECOND by: Vineburgh

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh*

NEGATIVE: None

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>*

5. Ratification of Meeting Minutes from 7/16/2020

Commissioner Richmond motioned to approve the application, Commissioner Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0-0 (AA, AR, MR, PT).



RECORD OF VOTE ON MINUTES

MOTION by: Richmond; SECOND by: Vineburgh

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh*

NEGATIVE: None

*Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>

6. Staff Updates

7. Adjourn – Approx. 7:30 PM

Commission Vineburgh motioned to adjourn the hearing. Commissioner Allen seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0-0 (AA, AR, MR, and PT).

RECORD OF VOTE ON ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by: Vineburgh; SECOND by: Allen

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh*,

NEGATIVE: None

*Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>

BEACON HILL ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

Members: MO: Arian Allen, BHCA: Vacancy, HNE: Miguel Rosales,
BSA: Danielle Santos, GBREB: P.T. Vineburgh,
Alternates: MO: Alice Richmond, BHCA Matthew Blumenthal,
HNE: Vacancy, BSA: Wen Wen, GBREB: Vacancy