



City of Boston, Massachusetts

Office of Police Accountability and Transparency  
**Stephanie Everett, Executive Director**

## Civilian Review Board (CRB) Public Meeting

### Minutes

Tuesday, November 15, 2022 | Scheduled for 11:30 a.m.

In-Person Meeting | 2201 Washington Street, Suite 102, Roxbury, MA 02119

Call to order at 11:34 a.m.

**Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Present:** Chair E. Peter Alvarez; Natalie Carithers; Joshua Dankoff; Anne Hernandez; Amy McNamee; Tara Register; B. Chris Sumner.

**Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Absent:** Rev. Wayne S. Daley; Carrie Mays.

### Introduction

Chair E. Peter Alvarez, opened the meeting by welcoming members of the public and the CRB members present. Established that quorum was present. Chair Alvarez reminded the public that public comment would not be heard during this meeting and that any comments could be sent to [opatboards@boston.gov](mailto:opatboards@boston.gov).

### Review & Approval of 8/9/2022 Meeting Minutes

The minutes were approved as presented by a unanimous vote of the CRB. No corrections were made.

### OPAT Executive Director's Report

Chair Alvarez introduced OPAT Executive Director, Stephanie Everett, to provide a report on OPAT's work to date.

Director Everett reported that OPAT has retained a consultant, Conan Harris & Associates and Strategy Matters, to examine BIPOC hiring, retention, and promotion practices within BPD, as well as paths for implementation. The consultant was retained recently and will begin the project on Monday, November 21, 2022. OPAT's Policy & Data Analyst, Mariah Sabir, will lead the project. The Boston Police Department (BPD) and the Boston Human Rights Commission are partners in this project and participated in selecting the consultant. Director Everett introduced the newest OPAT staff member: Diana Vergara, Investigator.



*City of Boston, Massachusetts*

*Office of Police Accountability and Transparency  
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director*

Applications for the Youth Advisory Council (YAC) are now open to the public. Applications have been sent to the Boston City Council and other City departments. In its first iteration, the YAC will have at least nine (9) members between ages 14 to 19, with the aim to collaborate with youth in need of direction and with untapped leadership skills. The deadline to submit an application is Monday, November 28, 2022. With the leadership of OPAT's YEE youth workers, the YAC now has a mission statement that will guide its future growth. Director Everett also reported that BPD Commissioner Michael Cox has agreed to be a partner with the YAC and will give space for the YAC to speak directly to him.

OPAT is still hiring for the Community Mediator position and the college student internship. Director Everett shared that OPAT recently found a high school intern for its year-round internship.

*The Board took a five (5) minute recess.*

The CRB returned from its recess and Chair Alvarez opened the meeting to questions from the Board for Director Everett. Board Member Joshua Dankoff asked about any updates regarding the discipline matrix required by the OPAT Ordinance. Deputy Director John Steies answered that OPAT has been in communication with Commissioner Cox about the matrix, which is currently being developed.

Director Everett provided additional context to the CRB and explained that OPAT met with the Commissioner on Monday, November 6, 2022. A draft of the discipline matrix has been put together and, ideally, a draft or compromise on the matrix will be presented by the end of 2022. Some parts of the matrix may be subject to collective bargaining, as only the BPD Commissioner is able to approve disciplines. Director Everett noted that work on the matrix did not begin until Commissioner Cox was appointed; then-Acting Commissioner Gregory Long did not want to create a matrix that would bind a permanent commissioner. OPAT is working with Commissioner Cox to establish a matrix that the CRB will be able to use to determine effective disciplines.

There were no further questions from the CRB.



*City of Boston, Massachusetts*

*Office of Police Accountability and Transparency  
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director*

### **Other Business**

Chair Alvarez acknowledged that Board Member Chris Sumner joined the CRB meeting at 11:41 a.m.

No additional business was presented.

*The Board took a ten (10) minute recess.*

### **Complaint Summary & Disposition**

Chair Alvarez reconvened the meeting at 12:07 p.m.

Chair Alvarez explained that cases would be reviewed by the CRB in two groups. The first group of cases were being dismissed by OPAT per Ordinance and would be presented to the CRB in the public meeting. The second group of cases would be presented to the CRB in an executive session, closed to the public in the interest of confidentiality.

Director Everett clarified that the first group of cases was limited to cases deemed out of scope or that did not have sufficient information to proceed further. Director Everett reported that: Case #54 was closed at Intake; Case #80 was closed due to Insufficient Evidence; Case #85 was closed due to Insufficient Evidence; Case #87 was closed because it was Out of Scope; Case #95 was closed because it was Out of Scope; Case #97 was closed due to Insufficient Evidence.

Director Everett stated that OPAT Staff were recommending that Case #9, Case #26, Case #36, Case #58, Case #102, and Case #122 be reviewed by the CRB in an executive session. Chair Alvarez noted that the CRB would first review Case #102, return from executive session for a roll call vote on its disposition, and would reenter executive session to review the remaining cases. This was done to respect the time of those in attendance.

Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB was required to enter an executive session to hear the remaining cases in order to discuss the complaints brought against a Boston Police Department public officer, employee, staff member, or individual. Chair Alvarez stated that



*City of Boston, Massachusetts*

*Office of Police Accountability and Transparency  
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director*

the CRB would reconvene after the first executive session in a public session to hold a roll call vote on the disposition of Case #102.

Board Member Amy McNamee motioned to enter into Executive Session, pursuant to Open Meeting Law, M.G.L. c.30A, §§ 21, to discuss complaints brought against Boston Police Officers. The motion was seconded by Board Member Natalie Carithers. The motion was unanimously agreed upon by the Board.

The CRB's first executive session was called to order at 12:15 p.m.

### **Complaint Summary & Disposition – Public Session**

Chair Alvarez reconvened the CRB meeting in its public session.

Chair Alvarez held a roll call vote on Case #102.

In the matter of **Case #102**, the CRB voted unanimously to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**.

### **Complaint Summary & Disposition**

Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB was required to enter an executive session to hear the remaining cases in order to discuss the complaints brought against a Boston Police Department public officer, employee, staff member, or individual. Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB would reconvene after its second executive session in a final public session to hold a roll call vote on the disposition of the cases remaining on the docket.

Board Member McNamee motioned to return to Executive Session, pursuant to Open Meeting Law, M.G.L. c30A, §§ 21, to discuss complaints brought against Boston Police Officers. The motion was seconded by Board Member Dankoff. The motion was unanimously agreed upon by the Board.

The CRB's second executive session was called to order at 12:45 p.m. and closed at 3:06 p.m.

### **Complaint Summary & Disposition – Public Session**



*City of Boston, Massachusetts*

*Office of Police Accountability and Transparency  
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director*

Chair Alvarez reconvened the CRB meeting in its public session and noted that Board Member Anne Hernandez left at 2:09 p.m.

Chair Alvarez held roll call votes on each of the cases presented to the CRB during its second executive session.

In the matter of **Case #9**, the CRB voted unanimously to adopt the disposition of **Insufficient Evidence to Make a Finding**.

In the matter of **Case #26**, the CRB voted unanimously to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Insufficient Evidence to Make a Finding**.

In the matter of **Case #36**, the CRB voted unanimously to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**.

In the matter of **Case #58**, the CRB voted unanimously to adopt the disposition of **Insufficient Evidence to Make a Finding**.

In the matter of **Case #122\***

\* Pending legal review

Chair Alvarez motioned to adjourn the meeting and received a second from Board Member Carithers. All six (6) CRB members present voted to adjourn.

The 2023 CRB meeting dates will be determined at the OPAT Commission Community Meeting on Tuesday, December 6, 2022.

**Meeting Adjourned at 3:15 p.m.**