

PFD Review Comments for O'Bryant Massing

August 28, 2023

The Public Facilities Department (PFD) was asked to review the proposed O'Bryant program developed for the West Roxbury Education Complex at the following alternative locations: Timilty School, BWSC Parking Lots and Campbell Resource Center. Based on the massing that was performed by Machetto Salvetti at all locations, PFD does not recommend any of these locations for the following reasons:

1. Timilty School

1. Proposed new buildings on this site to fit the program would require 6+ stories, which is out of scale and character with other surrounding buildings.
2. This district is a historical overlay district and is adjacent to a historic building (Dillaway-Thomas House)
3. Proposed building takes up the entire site.
4. Limited parking.
5. No space for athletic or play fields, although Madison Park fields could possibly be utilized/shared.
6. Higher costs associated with added demolition and construction of an all new building.

2. BWSC Parking Lots

1. Four individual parcels, separated by public streets that provide access to residential and commercial buildings. At a minimum, one of the streets would need to be removed.
2. Building massing would need to incorporate various setbacks, reveals and open space to avoid a monolithic street front presence, all of which would be challenging given the high ratio of required program area to available site area.
3. Eight stories and a roof penthouse could be operationally challenging for a BPS high school.
4. BWSC parcels are currently proposed for other uses, following a community process, and are subject to a federal funding deadline to support redevelopment.
5. Higher costs associated with new construction.
6. Limited field space.

This is a better site than the Timilty School, but not ideal.

3. Campbell Resource Center

1. Proportions are more industrial than a welcoming school, however this is just a massing exercise, and the building could be reconfigured due to the size of the lot. Currently laid out as 4+ stories and a roof.
2. Proposed field is adjacent to the Eversource power station. Parcel is adjacent to the BPS bus yard and expressway.

3. Would require relocation of critical BPS services: Welcome Center, Central Energy Management Operations Center (CEMOC), Facilities Department, warehouse, etc.
4. Higher costs associated with added demolition and construction of an all new building, in addition to relocation costs and building/leases to house current services.

This is the best of these three options, but not recommended due to the industrial setting, operational challenges and higher costs related to the relocation of current services at Campbell, and impacts to schedule.

****NOTE: None of the options 1-3 include a pool or associated locker rooms.***

By contrast, the West Roxbury Education Complex – the original site evaluated by Machado Silvetti – is the recommended option for the following reasons:

4. West Roxbury Education Complex
 1. Existing 5-story structure with capacity to expand.
 2. Ample site area.
 3. Adjacency to playing fields and green spaces.
 4. Renovation of existing structure provides construction cost savings and is more environmentally sustainable than tearing down and building new.
 5. Rear of the school is adjacent to wetlands. This will need to be mitigated during design and construction.
 6. Existing pool and locker rooms.