



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director

Civilian Review Board (CRB) Public Meeting

Minutes

Tuesday, May 10, 2022 | Scheduled for 11:00 a.m.

Virtual Meeting held remotely via Zoom due to COVID-19 Pandemic

Call to order at 11:05 a.m

Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Present: Chair E. Peter Alvarez; Natalie Carithers; Rev. Wayne S. Daley; Joshua Dankoff; Anne Hernandez; Carrie Mays; Amy McNamee; Tara Register; B. Chris Sumner.

Chair, E. Peter Alvarez, opened the meeting by welcoming attendees.

The Mayor's Office of Language and Communication Access facilitated language services for this meeting. The verbal language interpretation services were provided in Spanish, Haitian Creole, Mandarin, Vietnamese, and Cantonese. American Sign Language services were also provided.

All attendees were informed that during the meeting: automatic closed captioning could be turned on through Zoom; there were 5 spoken language channels that members of the public could use; all members of the public would have their cameras turned off; this meeting was public and was being recorded.

Chair Alvarez introduced himself as the CRB Chair and provided brief introductions of the CRB members present at the meeting.

Review of 2022 Temporary Calendar

Chair Alvarez presented the 2022 board meeting calendar to the CRB and explained that the calendar had been approved by the OPAT Commission of April 19th, 2022. He noted that all of the meetings listed in this calendar were to be held publicly and that the CRB's meeting on August 9, 2022, would be held virtually.



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director

OPAT Executive Director's Report

Chair Alvarez introduced OPAT Executive Director, Stephanie Everett, to provide a report on OPAT's work to date.

Director Everett reported that the FY23 budget was publicly released several weeks ago and detailed OPAT's proposed budget for FY23: \$1,465,684.00. This was an increase of \$165,000 from FY22.

Director Everett explained that the \$165,000 increase was due to three key investments proposed for FY23: the creation of a community mediator position, a year-long internship program for high school and college students, and the creation of a consultant position to examine BIPOC hiring, promotion and retention practices within the Boston Police Department.

Director Everett reported that she had met individually with all Boston City Councilors as of last week. These meetings were intended to provide the City Council with updates on OPAT's work in its first year. The meetings primarily focused on the foundation building including securing office space in Nubian Square, hiring staff, policy efforts, training of the boards and building capacity to receive and investigate complaints. In the next year, Director Everett is looking forward to continuing the work of building out the office, as well as partnering with the City Council on outreach efforts around public engagement with OPAT.

Director Everett provided a brief overview of the POST Commission meeting on May 3rd, 2022, in which the Commission passed a regulation establishing a timeline of 90 days to complete investigations. Director Everett noted that the OPAT Commission had discussed this proposed regulation at their April meeting and expressed their concerns about the shortened time frame given the substantial amount of time it can take to receive all information from complainants to begin an investigation and the steps required to vote on a recommendation by the CRB prior to a decision reaching the Police Commission. Director Everett has been in contact with the POST Commission to discuss the implications of this regulation on OPAT and the CRB. Director Everett will follow up with updates.



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director

Director Everett provided the CRB with a brief update on the status of the Boston Police Commissioner hiring search. The job description was posted publicly in April 2022 and the search committee has hired a consultant to assist with the search. The hiring group is aiming to select a candidate by the end of June 2022. Director Everett will provide updates if this timeline changes or if new information is announced.

Director Everett introduced OPAT's new Chief of Staff, Yasmine Raddassi, and briefly reintroduced the current OPAT staff members. Director Everett reported that OPAT is still hiring for new staff - three (3) intake workers and two (2) investigators - and that the job descriptions for OPAT's new internship program will be posted at the end of summer 2022, if the budget passes as proposed.

Chair Alvarez asked for clarification on the BPD Commissioner hiring timeline. Director Everett reported that the middle to end of June is the target date and that the search committee appears to be following this timeline. There were no updates on the amount of applicants for the position.

Complaint Summary & Disposition

Chair Alvarez moved the meeting to the next agenda item and asked Director Everett to proceed with OPAT's report on Case #29.

Director Everett presented Case #29. The complaint was received on March 29, 2022, and alleged that BPD vehicles were parked illegally on sidewalks outside of BPD headquarters, near the Whittier Street Health Center and Ruggles T Station. Director Everett reported that OPAT is limited by what it can investigate - OPAT is confined by the ordinance. Due to this, OPAT Staff recommended the CRB find that the complaint was Out Of Scope for an OPAT investigation. OPAT Staff also recommended that Staff direct the complainant to the Boston Transportation Department to properly address the subject of the complaint.

Chair Alvarez opened up the floor for board discussion.

CRB Member Joshua Dankoff asked if the Out Of Scope recommendation was due to the subject or the number of vehicles involved. Director Everett responded that parking is not



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director

within the purview of the Ordinance - the Ordinance contains a specific list of subjects that OPAT can investigate. If there had been an exchange between the complainant and a BPD employee or another possible form of misconduct, that would be something that OPAT Staff would have been able to investigate. Director Everett also noted that OPAT does not have access to RMV records and cannot verify if all of the vehicles reported in the complaint were BPD vehicles or a mixture of civilian and BPD vehicles.

CRB Member B. Chris Sumner asked if illegal parking of BPD vehicles - not limited to this specific complaint - would be considered a misuse of power. Director Everett responded that OPAT Staff would still have to check with the Boston Transportation Department (BTD) because BTD regulates parking issues. There is a possibility that BTD has permitted the parking situation described in the case and would be the best agency to respond to this case.

CRB Member Joshua Dankoff asked if there was a way for OPAT to refer the case directly to BTD. Director Everett responded that OPAT Staff can both reach out directly to BTD about the case and refer the complainant to BTD to resolve the case. Chair Alvarez asked if the CRB could add to the recommendation of Case #29 and include a separate vote to connect the complainant with BTD. Director Everett responded that OPAT Staff will follow those new recommendations if the CRB votes to approve it.

CRB Member Carrie Mays asked if a case were to be voted to be within the scope of the OPAT Ordinance, what the procedure would be in that situation. Director Everett responded that the CRB would have to determine what it considers to be within scope.

There were no further questions from the CRB Members.

Chair Alvarez determined that the CRB would vote on two (2) questions regarding Case #29.

The first question asked "Does the CRB agree with OPAT Staff's recommendation that Case #29 is Out Of Scope?" Chair Alvarez held a roll-call vote and the CRB voted unanimously (9-0) to find that Case #29 is Out Of Scope.



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director

The second question asked “Does the CRB approve the recommendation to Dismiss Case #29 and to direct OPAT Staff to connect the complainant with the Boston Transportation Department to resolve the original complaint?” Chair Alvarez held a roll-call vote and the CRB voted unanimously (9-0) to Dismiss Case #29 and to adopt the CRB’s recommendation.

Following these votes, CRB Member Joshua Dankoff asked if the parking issues raised by CRB Member B. Chris Sumner could be considered an abuse of authority and whether this case would create a precedent for the CRB in similar future cases. Chair Alvarez directed these questions to Director Everett. Director Everett responded that every case should be approached as though it is an entirely new situation and that case findings do not establish a binding precedent. Director Everett also reminded the CRB that the OPAT Ordinance grants the CRB power to create and look into policies. Director Everett stated that the CRB could choose to direct OPAT to look at BPD’s parking policies as a whole and work with BTD to determine different ways for BPD employees to park safely while maintaining accessibility to all members of the public.

Director Everett noted for the CRB that an additional case had been included in the agenda prior to the meeting but had been removed. Case #19 was reviewed prior to the meeting and Director Everett determined that the investigation could not be presented at this time; Case #19 was removed from the agenda for continued investigation.

Other Business

Chair Alvarez moved the meeting to the next agenda item and asked the CRB if any members had outstanding questions. Chair Alvarez also noted for the CRB that the Board could look into the issue of parking and how it intersects with accessibility - particularly for disabled members of the public - and could look into whether BPD maintains an official policy on parking, obstructing sidewalks, or other issues.

CRB Member Joshua Dankoff referenced the section of the OPAT Ordinance that grants the CRB the power and authority to provide timely review of BPD policies and to provide



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency
Stephanie Everett, Executive Director

recommendations as needed. CRB Member Dankoff suggested to the chair that a review of BPD policies be added as a standing agenda item.

Chair Alvarez expressed interest in the idea and Director Everett stated that the OPAT Commission should possibly discuss procedures for how the CRB could initiate policy review discussions during regular meetings given the time needed to properly address the old policy, new policy and suggested revision. Director Everett suggested that the Commission could create a sub-committee focused on policy and present these matters at the meetings that would allow members more time to focus just on policy. Director Everett also noted that she will continue to provide any relevant policy updates during board meetings as they occur, as was the case with the POST Commission regulations. Director Everett suggested the idea of a subcommittee created by the OPAT Commission may be the best option and would propose this to the Commission. CRB Member Joshua Dankoff stated that he would like to be involved if such a subcommittee was created.

CRB Member Carrie Mays asked who within OPAT is in charge of engaging the community and creating outreach. Director Everett stated that OPAT is currently working with the Mayor's Office and its Communications team on how OPAT can become more visible. Director Everett also noted that OPAT Staff participated in the Youth Engagement job fairs throughout Boston for youth seeking summer employment and will be attending the upcoming coffee in the parks events.

CRB Member Joshua Dankoff asked about the status of the discipline matrix. Director Everett responded that the discipline matrix is still being developed and that when it is released, it will come from the BPD Commissioner.

Chair Alvarez thanked the CRB Members and audience for attending the meeting and noted that the next CRB meeting is scheduled for 11:00am on Tuesday, August 9th, 2022.

Meeting Adjourned at 12:14pm