



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

Civilian Review Board (CRB) Public Meeting

Minutes

Tuesday, January 23, 2024 | Scheduled for 11:00 a.m.

In-Person Meeting | 2201 Washington St, Suite 102, Roxbury, MA 02119

Call to order at 11:00 a.m.

Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Present: Chair E. Peter Alvarez; Natalie Carithers Utley; Joshua Dankoff; Tara Register; Anne Hernandez; B. Chris Sumner.

Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Absent: Rev. Wayne S. Daley.

Introduction

Chair E. Peter Alvarez opened the meeting by welcoming members of the public and the CRB members present. Chair Alvarez reminded the public that public comment would not be heard during this meeting and that any comments could be sent to opatboards@boston.gov. Chair Alvarez conducted a roll call for members and stated there was quorum.

Review and Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes

The September 12, 2023 and December 12, 2023 minutes were approved as presented by a unanimous vote of the CRB. No corrections were made.

OPAT Executive Director's Report

Chair Alvarez introduced OPAT Chief of Staff, Yasmine Raddassi, to provide the Director's Report.

Chief of Staff Yasmine Raddassi reported that OPAT's Executive Director position is still vacant and that the position is posted online for applicants to apply. People interested in the position must be a member of the Massachusetts Bar. Chief of Staff Yasmine Raddassi also reported that OPAT's executive team is currently finalizing the semi-annual report for the work that OPAT has done between July 2023 to December 2023. The Board asked about the timeline for filling vacant CRB seats. Chief of Staff Yasmine Raddassi stated that now



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

that City Council committees have been assigned, there should be some movement on holding hearings and working sessions for the City Council nominated seats.

Other Business

Chair Alvarez proceeded to move on to other business for the CRB. Board Member Joshua Dankoff asked about the process for dismissing complaints and notifying complainants, and expressed concern that the language in the notification letters to complainants stated that the CRB had dismissed the case. Chief of Staff Yasmine Raddassi explained that dismissed cases fall into four categories: out of scope, no misconduct alleged, open Internal Affairs case, or the individual is no longer a BPD employee. Chief of Staff Yasmine Raddassi stated that the language in the notification letters would be adjusted to clarify that OPAT Staff had dismissed the cases, rather than the CRB.

Complaint Summary & Disposition

After a review and investigation and in accordance with 12-16.7 (b) of the Ordinance, OPAT Staff referred the following cases to the Civilian Review Board for review and recommendation of disposition: Case #143, Case #148, Case #156, Case #169, Case #170, Case #184, Case #187, Case #189, Case #195, Case #219, and Case #232.

Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB would enter an executive session, pursuant to Open Meeting Law, M.G.L. c.30A, § 21(a)(1) and § 21(a)(7), combined with M.G.L. c. 30A, §§ 22(f) and (g), to hear the remaining cases in order to discuss the complaints brought against a Boston Police Department public officer, employee, staff member, or individual. Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB would reconvene in a public session to hold a roll call vote on the disposition of the cases remaining on the docket.

Board Member Anne Hernandez motioned to enter into Executive Session and received a second from Board Member Natalie Carithers. The motion was unanimously agreed upon by the Board.

The CRB's executive session was called to order at 11:20 a.m. and adjourned at 2:49 p.m.

Complaint Summary & Disposition - Public Session

Chair Alvarez reconvened the CRB meeting in its public session at 2:49 p.m.



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

Chair Alvarez held roll call votes on each of the cases presented to the CRB during its executive session.

In the matter of **Case #143**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt the disposition of **Not Sustained**.

In the matter of **Case #148**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to change OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of Insufficient Evidence to instead adopt a CRB disposition of **Sustained**. Per the BPD Draft Discipline Matrix, the mitigating penalty for violations of BPD Rule 102 §4, Rule 102 § 9, Rule 102 § 20, and Rule 103 § 1 Canon 2 is: Oral Reprimand to 5 Days. Accompanying recommended discipline from the Board is a **Five Day Suspension** for the officer that could be identified. The CRB also recommended that the Police Department further investigate the officers present. The CRB voted unanimously to adopt the recommended discipline.

The CRB did note that the change of recommendation was based on OPAT's video evidence that the reported incident did occur but BPD did not have the proper records. The officer in question was also unresponsive to attempts to investigate the matter. Stating that there was video of the incident with multiple officers present the CRB concluded that there should have been a record of this incident filed with the BPD and the Police Department and officer should have cooperated with OPAT's investigation of the matter.

In the matter of **Case #156**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt the disposition of **Exonerated**. The CRB also recommended that the Department review Rule 324 and update it.

In the matter of **Case #169**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt a disposition of **Insufficient Evidence**.

In the matter of **Case #170**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**.



City of Boston, Massachusetts
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

In the matter of **Case #184**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Sustained**. Per the BPD Draft Discipline Matrix, the mitigating penalty for a violation of Rule 302 §4.1 is: oral reprimand. Accompanying recommended discipline from the Board is an **Oral Reprimand and 1 Day Suspension**.

In the matter of **Case #187**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**.

In the matter of **Case #189**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**.

In the matter of **Case #195**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**.

In the matter of **Case #219**, the CRB voted twice for the proposed rule violations: BPD rule 304 §2: Use of Non-Lethal Force and Rule 315, sec.12d: Handcuffs. For rule 304 §2 the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Unfounded** for three (3) officers named in the complaint and **Exonerated** for two (2) officers named in the complaint..

In the matter of **Case #219** for BPD Rule 315 sec. 12d, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**.

In the matter of **Case #232**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**.

Chair Alvarez called for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Board Member Hernandez motioned and received a second from Board Member Dankoff. All six (6) CRB members present voted to adjourn until the next scheduled meeting at 3:01 p.m. on Thursday, April 25th..

Meeting Adjourned at 3:00 p.m.