



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

## Civilian Review Board (CRB) Public Meeting

### Minutes

**Thursday, May 15, 2025 | Scheduled for 10:00 a.m.**

**In-Person Meeting | 2201 Washington St, Suite 102, Roxbury, MA 02119**

**Call to order at 10:12 a.m.**

**Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Present:** Chair Samuel Harold; Joshua Dankoff; Dieuufort J. Fleurissant; Amaury Perez; Tanisha Deleon; Reginald Smalls; Bernard Fitzgerald; Peter Alvarez

### Introduction

Chair Samuel Harold opened the meeting by welcoming members of the public and the CRB members present. Chair Harold reminded the public that public comment would not be heard during this meeting and that any comments could be sent to [opatboards@boston.gov](mailto:opatboards@boston.gov). Chair Harold conducted a roll call for members and stated there was a quorum.

### Review and Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes

The March 27, 2025, minutes were approved as presented by the CRB by a vote of 8-0 after a correction was made to the spelling of Board member Joshua Dankoff's name.

### OPAT Executive Director's Report

Director Carvalho opened with an overview of the recent Budget Hearing. The office submitted a level-funded budget request totaling \$1,472,015. The hearing took place May 5th with the City Council's Ways and Means Committee. During the session, an overview of the department's work was presented, and questions from the Councilors were addressed. Council members expressed their support for the office and showed interest in remaining actively engaged and informed moving forward.

Next, Director Carvalho addressed recent personnel changes and efforts to build capacity. Mario Beauzile will be joining OPAT as the new Administrative Assistant beginning May 26,



*City of Boston, Massachusetts*  
*Office of Police Accountability and Transparency*

2025. Mario will be the first point of contact for visitors to the office and will also assist in supporting the boards. In staffing updates, long-time Investigator Tastery Reed has accepted a new position with the state. As a result, the office is currently recruiting for two Investigator positions, which will substantially increase the capacity to process cases and bring them before the OPAT Civilian Review Board.

The Director then spoke about community engagement activities. The most significant community event held in the past six weeks was the first OPAT Commission Meeting of the year, which took place on April 30th from 5:00 to 7:00 PM at the Bolling Building, located across the street from OPAT's office. Zoom access was also provided to increase accessibility. As with all OPAT Commission Meetings, this event was hosted by the three OPAT Commissioners: the Executive Director and board Chairs Sam Harold and Anthony Fugate. OPAT provided dinner for attendees, and OPAT's largest discussion to date was held regarding OPAT's work. Data was also shared along with insights and reflections from the Commissioners. Community members in attendance posed thoughtful and meaningful questions, offering ideas that helped foster connection and mutual understanding around the critical work of the office.

In addition to the Commission Meeting, community outreach has continued through the office's monthly OPAT Open Door Days. The April session focused on the office's Intake Process, while the May session centered on Investigations. Both events included dinner, a presentation on the topic of the month, and open discussion where community members could ask questions and engage on issues important to them. These efforts were led by Community Engagement Specialist Abdullah Beckett, with support from Executive Assistant Cheyenne Issac-Dorsainvil.

The office has also continued to hold bi-weekly Coffee Hours in neighborhoods across the city. Since the last board meeting, Coffee Hours have been hosted in Dorchester, Hyde Park, and Mattapan, with Jamaica Plain scheduled for June. OPAT remains active in the Nubian Square Task Force and regularly participates in the Nubian Square Safety Walks organized by the Torchlight Recovery Center. Additionally, Abdullah recently attended his first Marcus Garvey Task Force meeting. Staff members have also engaged weekly with residents across Boston through the Mayor's Coffee Hours.



*City of Boston, Massachusetts*  
*Office of Police Accountability and Transparency*

In closing, the Executive Director thanked the attendees and invited any questions. It was emphasized that the work being done by the office is both challenging and necessary, rooted in principles of human rights and civil rights.

In response to the report done by Director Carvalho, Board member Joshua Dankoff asked about the frequency of BPD Commissioner Cox's responses, to which Executive Director Carvalho responded that the office hopes to be receiving more responses as a new BPD deputy has been appointed.

Board member Reginald Smalls asked if there is currently a time frame in place for Cox to respond, while board member Fleurissant asked can the new deputy come to a meeting? To which Director Carvalho responded, "I hope him, the mayor, and (BPD) Commissioner will come."

**Other Business**

Chair Harold moved on to other business, which opened with a Discussion on OPAT's new policy subcommittee.

The board came to a unanimous consensus (8-0) to build a new Subcommittee with 3 members to review BPD Policies, Rules, and Procedures that will convene in 5 weeks.

**Complaint Summary & Disposition**

After a review and investigation and in accordance with 12-16.7 (b) of the Ordinance, OPAT Staff referred the following cases to the Civilian Review Board for review and recommendation of disposition: Case #287, #395, #295, #345, #262, #393, #398.

Chair Harold stated that the CRB would enter an executive session, pursuant to Open Meeting Law, M.G.L. c.30A, § 21(a)(1) and § 21(a)(7), combined with M.G.L. c. 30A, §§ 22(f) and (g), to hear the remaining cases in order to discuss the complaints brought against a Boston Police Department public officer, employee, staff member, or individual. Chair Harold stated that the CRB would reconvene in a public session to hold a roll call vote on the disposition of the cases remaining on the docket.



*City of Boston, Massachusetts*  
*Office of Police Accountability and Transparency*

Board Member Joshua Dankoff motioned to enter into Executive Session and received a second from Board Member Tanisha Deleon. The motion was unanimously agreed upon by the Board.

The CRB's executive session was called to order at 11:32 p.m. and adjourned at 4:24 p.m.

At approximately 3:45 PM 2 board members left due to time constraints.

**Complaint Summary & Disposition – Public Session**

Chair Harold reconvened the CRB meeting in its public session at 4:25 p.m.

Chair Harold held roll call votes on each of the cases presented to the CRB during its executive session.

In the matter of OPAT **Case #287**, the CRB reached a **unanimous decision of 6-0**, ruling **Sustained for Officer Tom Sullivan and Officer Richard A. Errico** regarding allegations of violation of **Rule 102§4 (Neglect of Duty)**, **Rule 102§20 (Self Identification)**. The CRB reached a **decision of 6-0**, ruling **Not Sustained** regarding **Rule 102§9 (Respectful Treatment)** According to the Case Report, “The Civilian Review Board reached a **unanimous decision (6-0)**, Sustained regarding allegations against Officer Richard A. Errico’s violation of Rule BPD Rule 102§8 (Directives and Orders).”

According to the Discipline Matrix established by the Boston Police Department, CRB has recommended the following discipline for Boston Police Officer Tom R. Sullivan:

1. BPD Rule 102 § 4 (Neglect of Duty): **15-Day Suspension**
2. BPD Rule 102 § 20 (Self Identification) Training and 5 Day Suspension **concurrent** with 15 Day Suspension for violation of Rule 102 § 4 (Neglect of Duty)

According to the Discipline Matrix established by the Boston Police Department, CRB has recommended the following discipline for Boston Police Officer Richard Anthony Errico:

1. BPD Rule 10 §4 (Neglect of Duty): **15-Day Suspension**



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

2. BPD Rule 102§20 (Self Identification) Training and **5 Day Suspension concurrent with 15 Day Suspension** for violation of Rule 102 § 4 (Neglect of Duty)
3. BPD Rule 102§8 (Directives and Orders): **5 Day Suspension from and after 15 Day Suspension** for violation of Rule 102 § 4 (Neglect of Duty)

In the matter of OPAT **Case #395**,

The Civilian Review Board reached a **unanimous decision (6-0), Sustained** regarding allegations against Sergeant Michael Aziz of BPD **Rule 102§3 (Conduct)**.

The Civilian Review Board reached a 5-1 decision in favor of Sustaining the below rule violation. However, because the voting results did not meet the 2/3 quorum requirement to reach a finding, the ultimate result of the CRB vote was **Unable to reach a Finding** for the **BPD Rule 102§4 (Neglect of Duty)**

According to the Discipline Matrix established by the Boston Police Department, CRB has recommended the following Boston Police Sergeant Michael Aziz receive an **Oral Reprimand** for violation of BPD **Rule 102§3 (Conduct)**.

In the matter of OPAT **Case #295**, the CRB reached a **unanimous decision** of **6-0**, ruling **Unfounded for Officer David L. Hale and Not Sustained for Sergeant Timothy Paul Coughlin** regarding allegations of violation of **Rule 102§3 (Conduct), Rule 102§4 (Neglect of Duty), AND Rule 102§9 (Respectful Treatment)**.

In the matter of OPAT **Case #345**, the CRB reached a **unanimous decision** of **6-0**, ruling **Unfounded for Officer Esther Auguste** regarding allegations of violation of **Rule 102§3 (Conduct), AND Rule 102§4 (Neglect of Duty)**.

In the matter of OPAT **Case #262**,

CRB reached a **unanimous decision (6-0), Not Sustained**, regarding allegations against Officer Mark Marron's violation of **Rule 102§4 (Neglect of Duty)**.

CRB reached a **unanimous decision (6-0), Sustained** regarding allegations against Officer Mark Marron's violation of **Rule 102§9 (Respectful Treatment)**.



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

CRB voted **3-3 (3 Not Sustained, 3 Sustained)** and therefore were Unable to Reach a Finding regarding allegations against **Officer Mark Marron's violation of Rule 304§2 (Non-Lethal Force)**.

According to the Discipline Matrix established by the Boston Police Department, CRB has recommended Boston Police Officer Mark Marron receive an **Oral Reprimand** for violation of **Rule 102§9 (Respectful Treatment)**.

In the matter of OPAT **Case #398**,

The Civilian Review Board reached a **unanimous decision (6-0), Sustained** regarding allegations against Keva Phillips, who is a Dispatcher for BPD **Rule 102§3 (Conduct), Rule 102§4 (Neglect of Duty), AND of Rule 102§12 (Sleeping on Duty)**.

According to the Discipline Matrix established by the Boston Police Department, CRB has recommended the following:

Dispatcher Keva Phillips receive a **5-day suspension for violation of Rule 102§3 (Conduct)**.

Dispatcher Keva Phillips receive a **5-day suspension for violation of Rule 102§4 (Neglect of Duty), concurrent with a 5-day suspension for violation of Rule 102§3 (Conduct)**.

Dispatcher Keva Phillips and her supervisor receive **training and further investigation for violation of Rule 102§12 (Sleeping on Duty)**.

In the matter of OPAT **Case #393**,

The CRB reached a **unanimous decision** of 6-0, ruling **Not Sustained** for **Officer Taylor Green, Detective Stephanie O Sullivan, and Officer James C. Hosea** regarding allegations of violation of **Rule 102§4 (Neglect of Duty)**.

The Civilian Review Board did not review case #322 due to time limitations of the board members present.

**Meeting Adjourned at 4:33 p.m.**